

**From:** [Bordona, Brian](#)  
**To:** [MeetingClerk](#); [Parker, Michael](#); [Anderson, Laura](#); [Ringel, Matthew](#)  
**Subject:** FW: Vida Valiente Use Permit #P20-00079-UP - Public Comment  
**Date:** Wednesday, May 1, 2024 8:35:31 AM  
**Attachments:** [Crystal Springs Road - Shawn Moura.docx](#)

---

---

**From:** Shawn Moura <shawnmoura@bellsouth.net>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, May 1, 2024 7:39 AM  
**To:** Bordona, Brian <Brian.Bordona@countyofnapa.org>  
**Subject:** Vida Valiente Use Permit #P20-00079-UP - Public Comment

[External Email - Use Caution]

Good morning Brian,

Here is my public comment for today. If the hearing runs late I won't be able to present it myself as I have to leave by 1:15pm to pick up my kids from school in St. Helena and attend a school board meeting.

Thank you for your help and time.

Shawn Moura  
236 Crystal Springs Rd  
St Helena CA

## Vida Valiente Winery Use Permit Application #P20-00079-UP

My name is Shawn Moura and I live at 236 Crystal Springs Rd, I am a full time resident and have 3 children living with me at this residence. My parents also live on the north fork and I am here to express my concerns with the ability of Crystal Springs road to accommodate the huge infrastructure heavy winery project that will further deteriorate the already poor condition of this road.

Did you know that Cystal Springs Road used to be the main north south road on the east side of our valley? Then the Trail was built in the mid 1940/50's leaving Crystal Springs Road to residential and agricultural traffic and the road hasn't changed much since then. And no, I didn't read this on the internet... I know this because my Grandpa was literally born on the road and lived his entire life here.

I walk Crystal Springs Road with my kids and/or dogs every other day and I encounter daily traffic jams with today's normal daily use. I don't allow my kids to walk it alone because the traffic is so heavy and I've since stopped walking at the south end because of the narrow road, blind turns and fast driving cars. My near misses while walking the road became too frequent so I abandoned the south end for my daily walks.

You have or will see photos today to show the common issues encountered when large trucks use the road for winery deliveries, utilities work and home construction. Two large trucks cannot pass in several sections of this road both at the north and the south ends. The North side at the fork where Crystal Springs splits from the North fork cannot fit two vehicles at the same time. One has to backup to allow the other to pass. I see this frequently when a large water hauling truck takes 5 daily runs along this fork on one of the 10 times a day I drive by doing kid drop off and pick ups.

We have crumbling pavement and retaining wall along a narrow section just installed in Fall of 2023 that is already failing with our "normal" traffic. This road will fail with daily heavy usage by heavy dump trucks. Remember when the Trail was closed in St. Helena when the river eroded away the soil under the Trail last year and it was closed for thru traffic? That's the scenario that's already setup on Crystal Springs as shown by photos today.

The physically heavy and frequency of loads imposed by large dump trucks hauling the cave spoils for YEARS from the proposed project will very likely destroy what's left of this road, rendering it unusable for those that live along it.

The main water supply line for the City of St. Helena runs within few feet of Crystal Springs road edge. Should the road fail, the water line will likely be ruptured. Who bears responsibility for the fix? Napa County or the City of St. Helena?

In addition to water, a major gas distribution line to Deer Park and Angwin is located near the cracked pavement. The road is also on the St Helena Unified School district bus route.

I am in support of wineries and new construction. But I am against a plan that doesn't fit safely into the infrastructure that is in place to support its residents. It's a bit of the chicken and egg scenario here. If you approve this project, the county plan and funding to expand and secure Crystal Springs Rd must also be approved. But the road infrastructure is NOT part of the scope of this project. I'm

not suggesting who should pay for the infrastructure needs, I'm just saying that the scope of THIS project requires it to be in the plan.

The plan I've seen today will jeopardize the safety and welfare of the residents of this neighborhood and the water supply of the City of St. Helena and the gas lines for Deer Park and Angwin. The plans can be changed to mitigate these risks. But as the project is scoped today it does not mitigate the risk and should be denied on those grounds.

Respectfully submitted,  
Shawn Moura  
236 Crystal Springs Road  
May 1, 2024

## Vida Valiente

Lee Hudson <lee@hudsonranch.com>

Wed 5/1/2024 8:47 AM

To:MeetingClerk <MeetingClerk@countyofnapa.org>

[External Email - Use Caution]

dear commissioners

Please accept my comments in regards to your discussion's regarding Vida Valiente winery

I'm concerned about the direction the public review of projects is going. It's critical that projects and applicant are treated equally and viewed through tthe lens of the general plan and public policy

The following are my main concerns:

- Planning Commission and Board of Supervisors are creating policy project by project, not following existing General Plan or county rules & regulations - even when projects are compliant with county requirements
- Board of Supervisors adopted Road & Street Standards. Commission should apply them, not modify them on case-by-case basis.
- Board of Supervisors did not require private property owners to improve conditions of public roads that don't meet new standards
- Discretion should be based on findings of fact, not personal opinion or special interest agendas

Thank you for you consideration

Lee

Lee Hudson

Co-Founder

Hudson Ranch, Vineyards & Wines

Hudson Greens & Goods

hudsonranch.com

## DEFICIENT CEQA ANALYSIS

I am Patricia Damery, Dry Creek Road, Napa, CA. I want to address four omissions which make the CEQA Analysis deficient.

First Omission: The CTG Traffic Study erased Rose Lane from its maps whose residents will be blocked from escaping to Sanitarium Road by just 12 cars lined up on Crystal Springs Road.

The study completely erased from its maps Crystal Springs North with 2 wineries (Tuck Beckstoffer Dancing Hares, and Reverie II) whose activities could easily block the skewed intersection with Crystal Springs Road and the designated access to Vida Valiente. Second omission!

It did not identify 2 more wineries (Merus Winery and Woodbridge) directly on Crystal Springs Road and their impacts. Third omission!

If these four wineries were not identified, their cumulative impacts were not examined under CEQA.

More importantly, Vida Valiente—and the county Staff Report—failed to examine evacuation scenarios and routes, which is mandated under CEQA. Fourth omission!

Furthermore, the permitting of this project on substandard Crystal Springs Road is in direct conflict with the Board of Forestry's State Minimum Fire Safe Regulations for any road in the State of California. Napa County is not above the law.

Patricia Damery

**Re: Vida Valiente Use Permit Application #P20-0079-UP**

**May 1, 2024**

**Results of Neighborhood Poll of Crystal Springs Rd. and Rose Lane**

At the previous hearing on Dec. 6, there was a comment regarding whether those of us residents who voiced our opposition to the Vida Valiente project, represented the opinions of the neighborhood or were just a vocal minority. We decided to do our own poll and ask the question.

Residents were asked: “Are you in favor of, opposed to, or neutral regarding the proposed Vida Valiente Winery?”

The results were that of the 75 queried, 70 were opposed and 5 were neutral. There were zero votes in favor. So, opposition was 93% with the remaining 7% per cent not expressing an opinion, pro or con.

Those polled were residents of Crystal Springs Road and Rose Lane. Excluded in the poll were properties owned by the city, hospital or wineries since they are not occupied by residents.

This confirms the strong opposition to the Vida Valiente project by residents who live here. Despite what so-called experts may say, we know this area the best and are in the best position to know what the effects of this project are likely to be. This is our home—our opinions matter.

Submitted by Valerie Jespersen-Wheat

788 Crystal Springs Road

St. Helena, CA 94574